REPORT OF THE SAFE CAMPUS REOPENING WORKGROUP

May 22, 2020

Bill Rawlings, Classified, Mt. San Antonio College
Brian King, Chancellor, Los Rios CCD
Byron Breland, Chancellor, San Jose CCD
Cheryl Aschenbach, Secretary, Academic Senate for CCC
Danny Thirakul, President, Student Senate for CCC
Francisco Rodriguez, Chancellor, Los Angeles CCD
Joe Wyse, President/Superintendent, Shasta College
Martha Garcia, President/Superintendent, Imperial College
Pamela Luster, President, San Diego Mesa College

Table of Contents

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY / CHARGE OF THE WORKGROUP	.2
ORGANIZATION OF THE REPORT	.2
I. A framework around indicators of when to begin to open college campuses	.3
II. Recommendations around best practices for continuing instruction with social distancing	.4
III. Recommendations on a framework of best practices for supporting the classified staff and	ł
faculty as we re-open college campuses1	.0
IV. Recommendations to the Chancellor's Office on any changes to regulations impacting	
space utilization that may be required due to the anticipated social distancing protocols1	.4
V. Recommendations on how to position our advocacy efforts to support the rapid workforce	š
training necessary to get Californians re-employed1	.6
VI. Recommendations on any other guidance, frameworks, or best practices that would be	
applicable to position the system to support the recovery of our communities and state2	.1
CONCLUSION2	:3
Resource List as of May 22, 20202	<u>'</u> 4

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY / CHARGE OF THE WORKGROUP

On April 29, 2020, Chancellor Eloy Ortiz Oakley requested that Joe Wyse, President of the Chief Executive Officers Board for California Community Colleges, "establish and appoint a chair to lead a high-level task force to develop guidance and recommendations for the Chancellor's Office to consider in supporting districts and colleges as they plan for re-opening of their campuses." Chancellor Oakley also directed the Workgroup to provide updates on recommendations to the Consultation Council with recommendations due to the Chancellor's Office by May 22, 2020.

President Wyse promptly appointed a chair and a task force in response to the charge from Chancellor Oakley. The volunteer members of the Workgroup have met regularly since their appointment and have sought feedback and insights from a variety of important groups and individuals. The full Workgroup has met with Consultation Council and the CEO Board of the Community College League of California, and also has met with leaders from across the country in states where the reopening may be happening at a faster pace than in California. Individual members of the Workgroup have also met with a broad cross-section of individuals and groups and also received countless emails with questions and issues presented. Given the short timeline, members of the Workgroup have engaged as many stakeholders as possible and devoted countless hours to this important task.

Since the charge to create a Workgroup was presented on April 29, the landscape has continued to shift on a seemingly daily basis. Many community college districts have announced an intention to move the fall semester to a predominantly online modality, as has the entire California State University system. With this seismic shift in mind, the Workgroup has focused more intently on short-term issues involving the continued transition to remote operations and online instruction within the context of broader campus reopening now likely to happen later in 2020 or in early 2021. The Workgroup recognizes that today's report represents a moment in time, and that changing circumstances could quickly result in some of the recommendations becoming outdated or no longer practical.

ORGANIZATION OF THE REPORT

The Charge from Chancellor Oakley included six key issues for the Workgroup to address. The Report is organized in response to the issues presented. One or more members of the Workgroup prepared a section of the Report in response to each of the six issues.

I. A framework around indicators of when to begin to open college campuses.

The decision of when to begin opening California's community college campuses will depend upon a complex array issues that are significantly local in nature. A multitude of considerations shape planning to reopen our colleges when State and local guidance allow. A key document for the state of California is the <u>Update on California's Pandemic Roadmap</u>. On May 20, 2020, the Workgroup learned that the California Office of Emergency Services (Cal OES) has determined that higher education will be included in Stage 3 of the modifications of the statewide stay at home order. Stage 2 reopening is under way and varies by county. The California Department of Public Health has issued a communication that indicates that the reopening of higher education for larger scale in-person operations is not permitted in Stage 2, which includes K-12, of the state's reopening.

In short, it appears broad reopening for in-person college operations will not be permitted until a county is determined to be in Stage 3. No counties are currently at Stage 3. Not all counties will move to Stage 3 at the same time as is the case in counties currently moving to Stage 2. As is the case with so many issues involving COVID-19, the criteria to allow for the transition from Stage 2 to Stage 3 are not entirely clear and continue to evolve. In addition, some on-campus activities might qualify as Stage 2 activities, so additional clarification will be needed.

In addition to the state guidance coming from OES and Governor Newsom, FEMA provides high level federal guidance in this <u>Fact Sheet</u>. OSHA also has guidance that can be found <u>here.</u> County and local officials will be crucial in the determination of when to begin the re-opening process within the framework of state guidelines from the Governor and legislature as outlined in the Update on California's Pandemic Roadmap.

The following is a non-exhaustive list of items for a potential framework to consider when planning for reopening a college when a county has entered Stage 3:

- 1. Consider staff/faculty continuing to work from home, perhaps on staggered shifts/days on site in light of the need to spread out workstations to maintain 6 feet between cubicles/work spaces.
- 2. Plan for a portion of employees to continue to work remotely. Employees over 65 years of age and those with underlying medical conditions will likely work remotely longer than others. An explanation of underlying medical conditions can be found on in Appendix A of the CDC's Community Mitigation Strategy.
- 3. Plan for time between uses of spaces (class offerings, use of offices, etc.) for cleaning. The CDC's has guidance for cleaning facilities on its website.
- 4. Evaluate the potential to add glass/plexi-glass partitions in work spaces, including labs. Such mitigation may allow faculty can oversee two rooms at once while better accommodating social distancing.

- 5. Plan for potential exposures of students/employees and resulting two weeks of isolation that follows. Consider in the first stage of reopening to keep a portion of buildings unoccupied in order to shift use should an exposure occur in a newly reopened building.
- 6. Consider online and hybrid formats to courses, with alternating days to use larger rooms for more course sections.
- 7. Finally, plan for the longer term and the potential change in the situations over the coming months. There is potential for a resurgence of the virus in the fall. The CDC has numerous links to <u>forecasting models</u>. Some are suggesting social distancing may need to be in effect for 12 to 18 months. For example, see an article on the National Science Foundation's website.

II. Recommendations around best practices for continuing instruction with social distancing.

As the California Community College system prepares to ensure that quality instruction continues during the pandemic, the safety of students and employees is our top priority. The following recommendations should be considered by colleges within their unique local contexts, including district collective bargaining agreements and implemented as appropriate to their regional situations and guidance by local public health authorities.

These guidelines are based on information about COVID-19 that is known today with the understanding knowledge is evolving quickly. The guidelines are purposely broad for universal use and written with the understanding that colleges will deploy finite resources to implement guidelines. California Community Colleges should view these guidelines and evaluate the feasibility of these recommendations in the light of their own institutional environment, community resources, public health capacity, demographics, internal resources and risk tolerance.

General considerations as suggested by the American College Health Association (ACHA) should include, but are not limited to:

- Prioritization of in-person instruction for courses with academic outcomes that cannot be measured or achieved virtually, such as performance, laboratory, and clinical experiences.
- Implementation of an online or hybrid mode of instruction for the foreseeable future.
 Remote options should be planned for and available in the event that a rebound in local infections necessitates continued physical distancing and to support vulnerable students and staff, students in quarantine or isolation, and students and staff who cannot physically return to campus.
- Limitation of the number of attendees for in-person courses/sections. In most cases, all in-person courses/sections should be limited and also utilize other physical distancing measures.

- Implementation of close monitoring and tracking of in-person attendance and seating arrangements to facilitate contact tracing in the event of an exposure.
- Development of a physical distancing plan for each course that includes:
 - Number of students and faculty present in each session;
 - Length of session;
 - Nature of activities;
 - Mechanisms to conduct student and faculty symptom checks;
 - Public health practices: face coverings, 6 feet of physical distancing; cough/sneeze etiquette, hand hygiene;
 - Provisions for hand sanitizer and enhanced cleaning;
 - Instructions to participants on the course-specific physical distancing protocol;
 and
 - Availability of remote options.
- Development of specialized plans for students who are at increased risk due to the
 occupational nature of their studies. Examples include health professional students and
 students engaged in out-of-classroom or community-based instruction. Ensure students
 are provided with adequate Personal Protective Equipment, supervision, and other
 protections based on their risk.
- Expansion of simulation experiences (if approved by accrediting body) to create clinical scenarios for health professional students to practice technical, diagnostic, and exam skills.
- Development of attendance and excuse policies that acknowledge and support students who become ill without creating barriers and without requiring unnecessary visits to health facilities for documentation of illness.
- Encourage faculty-student communication regarding health status and any changes in their ability to complete coursework and academic responsibilities.
- Identification of resources for students with learning disabilities or difficulties with remote learning platforms.

The Academic Senate for California Community Colleges in collaboration with the other stakeholders, has developed recommendations that enable colleges to offer limited face-to-face instruction safely and tactically. In addition, specific considerations should be made depending on the discipline being taught.

In order to resume instruction securely and strategically the following considerations should be contemplated:

- Plan to limit face-to-face instruction by utilizing online and hybrid instruction. Engage with
 faculty to evaluate expected offerings to determine what courses must be at least
 partially taught on campus;
- Ensure student, faculty, and staff have access to technologies needed, including laptops, Internet access, and necessary applications, as well as IT support and training for the technologies;

- Determine feasibility of various scheduling methods for resuming instruction in courses that must have on campus elements;
- Close or restrict common areas on campus, using barriers, or increasing physical distance between tables/chairs to discourage students from congregating in high traffic areas such as bathrooms, hallways, and stairwells;
- Develop a plan for flow of students to, from, and within physical class spaces for each class hosting students;
- Maintain safety precautions in the classroom; and
- Each discipline that is difficult to convert to virtual instruction should be considered distinctly when developing a plan to safely return to campus.

Career Technical Education

- Review accrediting, licensure, certification, or industry requirements for performance of hands-on skills, practicum, and clinical experience;
- Evaluate the degree to which students can achieve performance-related course outcomes using at-home versus in-class materials and equipment; and
- Consider whether equipment or materials may be made available for use at home rather than in class.

Lab Sciences

- Review lab outcomes to determine which must be completed in an on-campus lab setting versus those that can be completed at home, simulated online or via recordings;
- Consider major prep lab courses versus general education:
 - The need for on-campus labs may be greater for major prep lab courses versus those in primarily general education courses;
- For major prep lab courses, consider beginning versus advanced lab courses:
 - Hands-on performance of key labs may be more critical in advanced lab courses while skills developed in beginning lab courses may be reviewed and reinforced in a later class; and
- Consider whether equipment or materials may be made available for use at home rather than in class.

STEM

- Evaluate the degree to which students can achieve course outcomes online versus in class on campus;
- Evaluate the degree to which instructional support can be provided online versus in class on campus;
- Offer proctored assessments in small groups or waves for courses where online assessment creates inequity or integrity issues;
- Consider whether necessary equipment or materials may be made available for use at home rather than in class;

- Consider phased approach to on-campus instructional support services when feasible;
 and
- As reopening progresses, consider use of hybrid approach for lecture delivery to spread on-campus attendance of a class of students out across two to three days (similar to science and CTE labs) while also having a portion of class delivered online.

Visual/Performing Arts and Kinesiology

- Evaluate the degree to which students can achieve course outcomes online versus in class on campus;
- Evaluate the feasibility of providing appropriate amounts of performance feedback in an online environment;
- Consider the needs of major requirements versus general education requirements and offering of beginning versus advanced courses;
- Consider whether equipment or materials may be checked out or purchased for use at home rather than in class; and
- As reopening progresses, consider use of hybrid approach for lecture delivery to spread attendance of a class of students out across two to three days (similar to science and CTE labs) while also having a portion of class delivered online.

Humanities and Social Sciences

- Evaluate the degree to which students can achieve course outcomes online versus in class on campus;
- Evaluate the degree to which instructional support can be provided online versus in class on campus;
- Consider phased approach to on campus instructional support services when feasible;
- As reopening progresses, consider use of hybrid approach to lecture delivery to spread attendance of a class of students out across two to three days (similar to science and CTE labs) while also having a portion of class delivered online.

It is essential to determine the feasibility of various scheduling methods for resuming instruction to accommodate social distancing in courses that must include face-to-face elements. Some contemplations are depicted in this section:

- Options are dependent on faculty load and compensation considerations;
- Utilizing student attendance split across a distributed hybrid schedule (for example, 10 students each MWF @ 9am while others engage asynchronously online). May limit students to one attendance per class per week. Requires lab be set up 2-3 times each week; however, allows more time to clean between classes;
- Schedule on campus and virtual labs across a two to three-week period to limit total number of students in class at a time (for example, 1/3 of students would attend a face-to-face lab in a week while 2/3 of the students will work on a different simulated lab). May limit students to one attendance per class every 2-3 weeks.

- Schedule small group student appointments for a lab that is scheduled for an extended period on one day only. Lab setup for only a day with reset and sanitization between groups.
- As risks of transmission gradually are reduced, schedule courses (or sections of courses) back onto campus.

It is important to develop a plan for flow of students to, from, and within class spaces for each class hosting face-to-face students. Some guidelines to consider are:

- Plans should be specific to each class and classroom space;
- Evaluate direct pathways between parking lots and classroom spaces and establish directional hallways and passageways for foot traffic, if possible, to eliminate students from passing by one another;
- Identify parking locations, waiting spaces, entry doors, exit doors and designate separate routes for entry and exit into class or classroom spaces to help maintain social distancing
- Utilize door signs and ground markers to clearly guide students, faculty, and staff safely;
- When evaluating space for 6-ft distancing, collaborate with faculty to determine the amount of individual student movement within a workstation or lab space before measuring out 6 feet;
- Consider installing plexi-glass or other dividers, utilize large tables, or use outdoor space to create physical barriers between students and between students and faculty; and
- Minimize student movement beyond workstation or lab space (for example: provide supplies at each station rather than in a central location in classroom).

It is critical to maintain safety precautions in the classroom and on site to limit a surge of COVID-19 cases on campus. Consider the following:

- Conduct health self-screenings before students and faculty leave home or conduct health screenings upon arrival to campus in a centralized location;
- Utilize masks, handwashing, and social distancing as recommended by state and local departments of public health and other guidance organizations;
- Limit sharing of equipment during a class session, and if items must be shared, then disinfect between each use;
- Include sanitation supplies in all classrooms and offices and have regular decontamination procedures for public places, including classroom and office furniture, door handles and bathroom stalls
- Sanitize equipment and workstation or lab space between classes or when utilized by different students;
- Minimize or prohibit any student-to-student contact/interaction within the classroom environment that would necessitate less than 6 feet of spacing between participants. Have students work independently rather than in pairs or small groups;
- Embed performance of updated requirements for equipment and workstation sanitation as part of curriculum (when consistent with procedures in related industries);
- Utilize plexi-glass or other dividers and spacing between instructor station or lectern and students, and between staff and students in support services offices; and

• Determine at-home load/assignments for at-risk and immunocompromised faculty and staff (may mean splitting partial class loads between faculty).

There are a multitude of considerations to address when planning to reopen, dependent on State and local guidance. Some additional considerations include, but are not limited to:

- Impacts of lower class sizes and use of multiple lab sessions for small groups of students as part of hybrid delivery on faculty load;
- Impacts of varied on-campus and online asynchronous class attendance requirements on student schedules;
- Needs for resources (time, personnel, equipment, supplies) to facilitate social distancing and disinfection of campus equipment and facilities when providing on-campus instruction and student services;
- Needs for expanded mental health services for students, faculty, and staff, including online services;
- Provision or requirement of masks, gloves, and other safety equipment, is necessary to enhance the safety and well-being of students and employees; and
- Campus safety plans should address how to respond to and follow-up on occasions when students, faculty, or staff have COVID-19 symptoms, including occasions when such persons refuse to leave the class or campus.

Comprehensive Student Support Services

As we continue to adapt to our current environment, campus-wide preparation is the key to an organized, effective, safety-focused process of reopening. Ensuring quality instruction is offered to our students is pivotal. However, providing comprehensive student support services play a key role in student success. This effort will require the ongoing innovation and engagement of campus stakeholders that directly provide these services. The following guidelines are suggested:

- Create a campus **advising** plan that leverages existing campus technologies and adopts a wraparound student services philosophy.
- Create an online clearinghouse for best practices in providing virtual support services and universal design, accessibility, and accommodations for online instruction and student services.
- Provide training for students on how to succeed in an online class and how to access virtual advising, tutoring, testing and other academic and student support services.
- Provide wrap-around services that address food and housing insecurity.
- Mental and health services are critical during this period.
- Ensure all students have access to online tutoring.
- Ensure all student support staff have access to online interaction technologies like Zoom and CraniumCafe.
- Provide robust access to online library services.

- Reconfigure library support areas and computer resources to comply with social distancing protocols, if these areas will be available to students.
- Replace paper forms with online forms that can be submitted via email or technologies.

Access to Technology

The COVID-19 health emergency exacerbates inequities, especially for the most vulnerable student populations, who were already under-resourced before the pandemic. Student and faculty access to technology is critical. The following guidelines are provided for contemplation:

- Implement a survey of students' technology needs.
- Create outdoor hotspots and partner with businesses to provide internet access; provide lists of access points to students.
- Loan laptops that meet required specifications to students in need.
- If safe, consider opening up computer labs for general use; follow cleaning and social distancing protocols.

III. Recommendations on a framework of best practices for supporting the classified staff and faculty as we re-open college campuses.

The learning needs related the rapid conversion to remote instruction and services have had a significant impact on community college faculty, classified professionals, administrators and students. In order to succeed in the current environment, and successfully return to campus, the system must support robust assistance to all groups.

Faculty have had a daunting challenge in terms of the sudden conversion to online and remote instruction, in that for most, the courses were not designed nor being taught in that format when the closure of colleges commenced. Colleges have ramped up support for faculty in various ways by temporarily canceling courses and offering workshops, created just in time modularized support, assigned mentors to faculty to assist in the conversion and other curated and specific approaches. Statewide professional learning opportunities have been offered through @One, 3CSN and CVC-OEI along with proprietary assistance through LMS programs. What is needed is a coordinated and specific approach statewide to address a myriad of needs. In order to create successful learning experiences, the system must braid together its current resources to provide a much larger and comprehensive support system that will:

- 1) Create opportunities for discipline faculty to coordinate and partner on virtual instruction. Utilize Academic senate regions and discipline structures to pair faculty with @one experts across and within disciplines.
- 2) Provide clearly communicated expectations for remote learning in courses that are not specifically identified as distance education.
- 3) Provide adequate support for courses that require demonstration of skills in a face to face format. (Sciences, CTE, Arts)

- 4) Assist faculty in designing flexible formats such as hybrids, all online and face to face that could potentially happen for a single course all in one semester.
- 5) Suspend unnecessary administrative procedures related to course approval.
- 6) Create a safe return to campus plan that considers physical distance, classroom design, classroom materials and faculty/student interaction from a teaching and learning perspective.

In discussions with faculty senate, 3CSN and @one, it has been noted that this is an opportunity to have faculty spend time not just discussing remote learning, but in fact improving practices across the board. In essence, the need for flexibility also lends itself to thinking about learning in all formats. Further work is necessary to assess these needs, pull together faculty experts, and launch a group that will successfully address these recommendations.

Similarly, classified professionals have the need to find tools and experiences that create equitable support for their remote work. The following are areas identified by classified professionals:

A. Recommend Online Professional Development for classified to help with key skill building to help students and our colleges during and beyond COVID-19: As the COVID-19 pandemic has affected in-person professional development opportunities (conferences, trainings, meetings, etc.) professional development specific to dual-platform delivery of student support services and what those services are

- 1. On-the-ground and in-person orientations, mentorship, advising, referrals to resources, answer questions, etc.
- 2. Virtual orientations, mentorship, advising, referrals to resources, answer questions, etc.
- Training related to supporting colleagues and students who have personally been affected by COVID-19 and how it impacts work and studies.
- Sensitivity training regarding COVID-19 and how differences in opinion, political affiliations, and personal experiences have shaped employees and students and how to respect our differences.
- Online professional development through Franklin Covey such as "7 Habits of Highly Effective People" or "Leading at the Speed of Trust" or similar organizations and training. Allow for extended training throughout the semester.
- Statewide online focused statewide discussion for Classified Professionals focused on best practices in areas such as student success, equity, wraparound services, etc.
- Opportunities to learn about creating healthy daily working routines, workplace set-up, and handling difficult work situations alone.

B. Recommend advancing technology support so that classified can better serve our students.

 Microsoft Teams, Cranium Café, Jabber, Zoom, and a host of other technology tools so that our employees can stay connected and our students can access our employees remotely.

- When we return to the campus meetings should still be held virtually when possible, so
 continue to build on this and strengthen our online remote working skills and tools. When
 we do return to the campus, in-person meetings may still be disrupted. We will need to
 further train our classified on remote working technology and the colleges will need to
 continue to look to strengthen technology tool offerings to help with serving our students,
 faculty and the campus community.
- Working remotely requires more effective communication, and collaboration. Support to enhance these skills in individuals may be necessary.
- Invest in software that will eliminate lines in key services (A&R, counseling, financial aid) and will send a text to the student when they are at the front of the queue.
- Increased bandwidth to support increased online presence and services.
- Training and professional help with software learning and graphic production and compliance for special populations.

Students too are significantly impacted in multiple ways in this learning environment. In a recent survey, the Student Senate surveyed students to assess their reactions and needs. By far the highest issue related to remote learning is the isolation and concomitant mental health issues, and the lack of resources or basic needs support to persist. Recommendations in the student arena are:

- 1) Communicate widely support for students, push intrusive student support through the LMS, through email and if available text. Create multiple live and static outreach campaigns through social media and create opportunities for feedback.
- 2) Create and maintain community through virtual affinity group experiences (Puente, Umoja, Next UP, Veterans, etc.)
- 3) Sustain operations that assess technology gaps and work with students to loan, give or make available levels of technology commensurate with expectations.
- 4) Create learning modules that assist students to use Canvas and other tools that will assist them in focusing on content, rather than barriers of technology.
- 5) Through student health systems, create open and accessible opportunities for appointments, group drop-ins and online resources for community mental health assistance.
- 6) Work with local student government associations to partner on messaging, support and advocacy for students.
- 7) Continue to advocate for financial aid reform, Cal Grant reform to provide adequate and equitable funding for community college students.

C. Recommend online distance learning/distance student experience Professional Development for Faculty, Classified and Administrators (our entire campus community) to better serve our students. We have been thrust into this online learning, online college experience very quickly. Many faculty have experience using Canvas for their online course offerings and some have good experience teaching online. However, the full experience of assisting students in distance learning is far beyond the class and Canvas. Considerations include:

- Develop Best Practices discussions, professional development training, and online resource guides on how to best assist our students from classroom to campus in a virtual environment. If we find the employees and the faculty returning to the campus, but the students remain mostly online, we will need to build upon our skills to best serve the students remotely to provide parallel student support and intervention services to DE learners that we provide to traditional face-to-face learners.
- Continued online training in the usage of Skype, zoom, Microsoft Teams, Cranium Café, NETTutor, etc.
- Address via survey how institutions are meeting/have met the hardware & Internet needs
 of students and workers. Create a plan for future semester(s).
- Software/Training: As above, with focus on gathering resource listings for both students and staff. This has been done to some degree but can be expanded.
- **D.** Recommend more dynamic online web presence experiences for students to find information and access to assistance. Students are shopping around for their classes and need information quickly. A virtual campus experience that helps students navigate the campus and easily find assistance via the college website.
 - Dynamic department directory.
 - Add information to include Cranium Café, zoom office hour, etc. for easy access by students.
 - Student self-scheduling options.
 - Directory of open online office hours.
 - Daily COVID updates and messages to students and employees.

E. All other Recommendations

- Recommend software support to expedite in-person processes to allow for social distancing.
- Allow employees to continue working remotely or hybrid work schedule, depending on iob duties.
- Schedule appointment times for students to come in, in addition to counseling services and provide Plexiglas or similar windows for key student traffic areas (A & R, Counseling, Financial Aid). The intention is for short-term use only until it is safe to remove and resume regular public contact.
- Space inventory of workspaces for adequate distancing.
- Support for staff who enforce distancing regulations (with students/community).
- Set up lounge/waiting room spaces with appropriate distancing.
- Safety communications on-campus via freestanding signs, floor decals, magnetic signs for doors, etc.
- Stagger employee work schedules to ensure people/space ratio is low and providing a safe working environment (Example: Employee A works M/W, Employee B work T/Th with rotating Fridays. Other days are remote work from home).
- Provide PPE for employees.

- Increase hand sanitizer dispensers or provide additional. Add handwashing stations throughout the campus.
- Sanitation supplies/stations and proper training (as needed with equipment) available in offices for regular cleaning of surfaces.
- Space/office inventory to determine if unused offices can be utilized for student service areas.
- Increase phone, Skype, zoom, etc. for communication between colleagues.
- Increase virtual methods in working with students.
- Ensure employees have the resources and technology to support working from home.
- Review how the distribution of CAREs funds and other sources have been utilized, including response to notices over email, social media, text messaging, general adverts. Create plan for optimization.

IV. Recommendations to the Chancellor's Office on any changes to regulations impacting space utilization that may be required due to the anticipated social distancing protocols

One of the units within the California Community Colleges Chancellor's office is the Facilities Planning Unit, which assists and supports the California Community Colleges' 73 districts in matters related to infrastructure and capital outlay. In short, capital outlay is money dedicated to acquiring, maintaining, building, repairing or upgrading fixed assets such as land, facilities, machinery and the like. As part of the facilities planning, this unit maintains a Space Inventory Handbook. Within this handbook is outlined the way in which space utilization is tracked and measured, which in turn affects the eligibility of individual district's access to state bond funding for new or remodeling of facilities.

With the decisions regarding remote learning during this global pandemic, questions will arise about the way in which space utilization is tracked and measured, and the needs of colleges for physical space. For example, will more traditional face-to-face lecture courses remain in synchronous or asynchronous formats than prior to the pandemic, either through hybrid or fully on-line formats? If so, should this affect space utilization calculations? Will social distancing be required/needed for more than the 2020-21 academic year? If so, should this need for more space per student affect space utilization calculations? These and other questions are important to be analyzed, however, we must keep in mind that facilities planning is necessarily a long-term view — up to a 50-year horizon — as the life of a physical asset such as campus buildings are planned for decades of use. Therefore, this Workgroup cautions that any contemplated decisions must look beyond the current crisis and anticipate the long history of operations before the crisis and examine any lasting changes to facilities needs over the next few years before making substantive changes to current facilities planning processes and regulations.

Overall, two areas are looked at in more detail below: 1) Broad issues surrounding social distancing measures and space utilization, and resulting considerations for changes to facilities planning and space utilization for the future of the community college system, and 2) broad suggestions for consideration for districts in planning for reopening campuses as safely as possible while maintaining the perspective that all operations involve managing risk.

Social Distancing and Space Utilization

The Center for Disease Control and Prevention's explanation of <u>social distancing</u> includes staying at least six feet from other people, not gathering in groups and staying out of crowded places and mass gatherings. If going out, it is recommended to wear a <u>cloth face covering</u>. Strict application of this guidance has dramatic effect on the ability to use many facilities and office spaces on college campuses. Most regular classroom settings capacity drops to 25% or lower of current capacity when social distancing measures between seats and egress paths are established. Others can drop to 10% when seating is fixed, such as in large theatre style lecture halls. Science labs often are set up with common station areas for four to six students, which could drop to one student per area. Some office areas are designed as cubical offices, without six feet of space between them. Other examples could be given. The following is a non-exhaustive list of considerations of the impact of social distancing on space utilization and operational costs:

- 1. The expected temporary application of social distancing requirements means that
 - a. Space utilization goes down as students are spread out
 - b. Cap/load ratio for lecture and lab space are increased
 - c. Cap/load ratio for office space are increased
 - d. Student areas in libraries, tutoring centers and other common areas are impacted
- There is a request submitted prior to this crisis to the DOF to change the standard square foot per student from 15 to 20 when considering classroom space utilization, which should be approved.
- 3. Over time, the amount of on-line instruction and its impact on the need for classroom space should be evaluated, in balance with projected growth of enrollment over time. CTE and other lab course space utilization needs are not expected to change significantly over time as this space largely serves courses not easily done—or not possible to do—via remote learning. The need for common areas such as library, tutoring, and study space for students may increase, especially areas made available with high speed internet connection for students.
- 4. The investment into programs such as the Student Equity and Achievement Program have made investments into more student support staff and faculty. A request was submitted prior to this crisis to the DOF to increase the office space square foot per full-time equivalent instructional staff member by 25 percent. The Workgroup recommends approval of this request by the DOF.
- 5. Furniture, fixtures, and equipment costs associated with construction projects may increase, as districts may plan for design changes to mitigate operational effects of future pandemics. For example, utility/internet and electronic queuing system infrastructure may be further enhanced as new and remodeling of facilities is planned.

- 6. Student housing needs may rise as a priority need even above current levels of discussion. Including potential student housing for districts desiring to pursue this model may be part of future funding requests. Design of student housing may change to address potential future pandemics.
- 7. Finally, it should be noted that equipment and maintenance expenditures for facilities, and for districts in general, will likely rise. Such things as regular change of HVAC filters will be accelerated, plexi-glass and other partitions built into design, barricades/gates at entrances for better access control, and costs for sanitation/cleaning supplies will increase.

This Workgroup recognizes the complexity involved in evaluating and recommending changes to space utilization regulations and procedures. It is best not to make a hurried judgement in the midst of the crisis. However, over the coming months, it is appropriate to task the existing facilities division of the CCCCO to engage with stakeholders to evaluate thoroughly the changes that may be needed to this important area of our system's resource planning that may be of a more permanent nature in order to make the wisest recommendations possible.

V. Recommendations on how to position our advocacy efforts to support the rapid workforce training necessary to get Californians re-employed.

Colleges and universities have been essential partners in our nation's defense against the community spread of COVID-19 by essentially transitioning fully to distance teaching and learning, student services and business operations since mid- to late March 2020. Our community colleges will also be essential to this state's and nation's economic recovery, and our system must leverage every resource, including robust and coordinated advocacy efforts in Sacramento and in Washington, D.C., to ensure that our role as regional economic drivers is understood, and that our voice and influence are present to continue the investment in higher education when it is needed the most.

How quickly things can change for California. What was once projected as a historic surplus of \$5.6 billion in January 2020 is now a projected historic budget deficit of \$54 billion. The budget news for California is sobering and clearly points to the unprecedented and devastating impact of the COVID-19 pandemic public health emergency on our State's challenging financial condition. Our System Administration and every community college district are now engaged with reviewing and analyzing the May Revision and its potential impact to our system of 115 community colleges, which serves 2.2 million students, and the anticipated threats to our traditional tenets of access, equity and affordability.

The COVID-19 health emergency exacerbates inequities, especially for the most vulnerable student populations, who were already under-resourced before the pandemic. Student basic needs, such as food security, housing, employment, mental health, access to technology, and

technology tools, emergency aid, have become more prevalent and disproportionately impact underserved students and communities.

In addition, we must all advocate for policies and resources that allow for the safe re-opening of our community colleges in the era of COVID-19 to improve our preparedness and responsiveness that includes putting in place the infrastructure for testing, surveillance, contact tracing and our capability to handle a surge, and isolate each and every new case at the state's community colleges.

As Congress continues to work to address the COVID-19 pandemic and its economic impacts, federal investment in a comprehensive national workforce development strategy that supports workers to reenter the workforce after job loss, businesses to minimize further job loss and business closures, businesses to create new jobs, and the preparation of workers and students for both today's in-demand jobs and those leading to economic growth after the pandemic. Reemployment, upskilling and reskilling for in-demand, living-wage jobs will be critical during the pandemic and its aftermath to ensure the best outcomes for workers and employers across the state and country.

We must engage in collective advocacy efforts for California community colleges through an equity lens and an equity mindfulness that aims to bridge the pervasive equity gap for underresourced students and communities that is only compounded as a result of the COVID-19 pandemic.

The recommendations below serve to position our advocacy efforts to support the rapid workforce training necessary to get Californians re-employed, and to strengthen the stability and responsiveness of our system of community colleges.

Recommendations

- 1. Establish an advocacy strike team to coordinate efforts and advance key messages on behalf of the California Community Colleges that is representative of the various constituency groups, stakeholders and interests a multi-stakeholder collaboration comprised of the state's education, government, workforce development, business, labor and community leaders. This system is committed to developing a robust and comprehensive economic and workforce development system to meet the employment and educational needs of communities severely impacted by the pandemic, with the intent of leveraging the collective assets of its partners to create career pathways to living-wage jobs and to improving the economic and social mobility of California workers.
- 2. Advocate for the federal government to invest an additional \$5 billion in Carl D. Perkins V funding to provide critical support to Career Technical Education (CTE) programs and allow the development of alternative online instructional modalities that integrate Artificial Intelligence solutions and Augmented/Virtual Reality technologies. CTE programs will be essential for retraining dislocated workers and this additional funding

- would allow rapid delivery of this training and secure future CTE efforts to ensure workforce readiness for in-demand jobs.
- 3. Advocate for a comprehensive national workforce development strategy that supports workers to reenter the workforce after job loss, businesses to minimize further job loss and business closures, businesses to create new employment opportunities, and the preparation of workers and students for both today's in-demand jobs and those leading to economic growth and prosperity after the pandemic.
- 4. Support safety net recipients access to training and employment in family-supporting jobs and direct federal agencies to waive work requirements for accessing benefits under Temporary Assistance for Needy Families (TANF), Medicaid and other means-tested programs to ensure recipients have time to upskill and re-skill to get back into good, family-supporting jobs including suspending a new rule that would make it harder for workers to access Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Program (SNAP) benefits for Able-Bodied Adults Without Dependents (ABAWDs).
- 5. Advocate for the federal government to reinvest \$5 billion in the TANF Emergency Contingency Fund (TANF ECF), modernizing the program to ensure workers with the greatest skill needs have access to subsidized jobs and training to prepare for in-demand industries so recipients can receive the training and employment assistance to succeed in good, family-supporting jobs.
- 6. Advocate for the federal government to make an additional investment of \$9 billion to the Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA) to ensure our public workforce system can best serve and respond to workers and employers impacted by the pandemic.
- 7. Create jobs through workforce investments as part of infrastructure projects that includes workforce training and re-employment funding in federal infrastructure proposals to include comprehensive training and support services with a focus on those who have been disproportionately impacted by racial inequities in education and labor policy.
- 8. Support local business-led workforce strategies to avert layoffs by expanding the Work Opportunity Tax Credit (WOTC) to provide businesses with tax credit of up to \$10,000 for costs associated with on-the-job learning and skills training for incumbent workers and expanding Short-Time Compensation for workers whose employers are forced to cut hours so employers can retain workers while still reducing costs and allows workers to maintain income levels without needing to access their full Unemployment Insurance benefit to which they'd be eligible if laid off completely.
- 9. Advocate for the federal government to incentivize higher education to respond to student, worker, and employer needs by investing \$6 billion in Trade Adjustment Assistance (TAA) Community College Training Partnership grants over the next 3 years to

support effective community college/business partnerships for in-demand training, including establishing apprenticeship programs and developing short-term credentials that allow for rapid re-employment. Moreover, in this time of crisis, community colleges stand ready to train the nurses, radiological technicians, respiratory therapists, EMTs, paramedics, and many others who are needed in the recovery and work on the front lines to fight COVID-19.

- 10. Expand access to Pell grants for high-quality short-term credentials in in-demand industries and increase the number of community college student state and federal financial aid applications through a coordinated, social media, public outreach and marketing campaign, thereby increasing the eligibility for state and federal financial aid.
- 11. Advocate for additional federal grants through the Department of Education and Department of Labor, that could serve as additional revenue streams for Hispanic-Serving Institutions (HSI), Minority-Serving Institutions (MSI) and workforce development and training.
- 12. Research and advocate for additional and potential federal legislation, such as the CARES Act II, Food for Thought Act and HEROES Act, or tax credits that could serve as additional revenue streams for student basic needs, adult workforce development, and dislocated worker employment and training. Per the May Revise, following budget reductions will occur unless the federal government provides sufficient funding to address the adverse impacts of the COVID-19 pandemic:

State Proposed Budget Reductions If Fede Available [in millions]	ral Funds Are Not
2.31 Percent COLA	\$167.7
Enrollment Growth	\$31.9
Apprenticeship Initiative	\$83.2
Offset SCFF Pro Rata Reductions	\$593.0
Strong Workforce	\$135.6
Student Equity and Achievement Program	\$68.8
Part-Time Faculty	\$7.3
Calbright College	\$3.0
Total	\$1,090.5

Other general advocacy recommendations include:

- 13. Assure California Community College districts receive the \$130.1 proposed property tax backfill, as proposed in the May Revise. the essential education functions and supports our system provides are not protected against revenue estimates that fall short. We request an automatic increase to the California Community College General Fund to backfill any shortfalls in apportionments, property taxes, and enrollment fees. Further, we seek reimbursement of enrollment fees refunded as a result of the COVID-19 pandemic.
- 14. Advocate for additional statutory flexibility at the state level to mitigate the adverse impacts of COVID-19, specifically to:

a. Student Centered Funding Formula (SCFF)

- 1. Reflect the revised 2019-20 Student Centered Funding Formula rates.
- 2. Further utilize past-year data sources that have not been impacted by COVID-19 within the SCFF.
- 3. Assure the extension of the SCFF hold harmless provisions for an additional two years.
- 4. Require reductions to the SCFF that are necessary to balance the budget to be proportionately applied.
- b. **Student Fees**: Allow the three public segments of California higher education to use restricted fund balances, except State Lottery balances, to address COVID-19 related impacts and the loss of revenue from enterprise functions.
- c. **50 Percent Law**: Exempt direct COVID-19 related expenses incurred by Districts from the 50 Percent Law.
- d. **Career Technical Education**: Suspend procedures regarding the development of short-term career technical education courses and programs to accelerate the development and offering of these programs and courses.
- 15. Institute emergency and temporary regulations for maximum flexibility for meeting inperson requirements and use of remote learning and other innovative modalities to satisfy allied health accreditors, including nursing, certified nursing assistant, respiratory therapy, veterinary technology, dental hygiene, mortuary science, police and fire academies, and in-home health care providers.
- 16. Advocate for additional resources to improve internet functionalities and ensure enhanced broadband bandwidth capacity, robust online course delivery of virtual labs, support services, and the purchase of equipment to enable faculty and staff to move operations to an online/remote learning modality, and strengthen the core infrastructure and provide a reliable and secure platform for the increased online/remote learning

activities. As California community college (CCC) districts and colleges transition classes and student services online in response to the COVID-19 pandemic, districts and colleges need a cohesive online infrastructure that is additive to existing infrastructure that support students, faculty, and staff.

- 17. Advocate for the increased funding of student basic needs such as housing and food insecurity as well as other basic needs such as transportation and childcare for under resourced members of our student community.
- 18. Promote more consistent access to statewide and national elected officials with a focus on providing focused and more open communication so on-going legislation will more likely be reflective of critical workforce training and recovery needs for under-served students and communities.
- 19. Continue to advocate for portable financial aid packages whereby a student can continue their education or job training out of state by utilizing any remaining state financial aid awards. For instance, this type of portability could be useful for African American students desiring to attend an HBCU (all HBCUs are out of state); primarily located in the southern region of the U.S.
- VI. Recommendations on any other guidance, frameworks, or best practices that would be applicable to position the system to support the recovery of our communities and state.

The following section provides some general guidance and best practices as they relate to positioning the California community college system to best create synergy, during and post COVID=19 recovery, amongst the communities it is charged to serve. The community college system is quite possibly the best strategic investment made by the state of California. They are well-positioned to provide quality education and job training opportunities to the majority of Californians. As such, these recommendations are made with the following assumptions: that risks will be reduced as there needs to be a focus on reopening safely; that we will make the recovery inclusive for the communities identified as the most vulnerable; that partnerships with business and industry should not ony be strengthened but should also be made more sustainable to better withstand the downturns; and that the recovery will need to be built upon a foundation that supports innovation as we move toward the 'new normal'.

Moreover, at the core of implementing these recommendations, an equity lens needs to be maintained as recovery work progresses and subsequent outcomes are measured. Specifically, there needs to be an approach that consistently considers, supports, and evaluates recovery strategies with a particular focus on our most vulnerable and under-served communities: low-wage workers, working poor, undocumented immigrants, seniors, and communities of color.

Finally, these recommendations must be considered with the understanding that a recovery effort of this magnitude cannot be the sole responsibility of one sector and that everyone must contribute to rebuilding our communities and state, along with fortifying key public health supports and their requisite infrastructure.

Recommendations

- 1. As a best practice, the state should invest in accelerated programs, online instruction coupled to holistic student supports, career pathway-embedded credentials, and work-based learning for credit that equips students to 'earn while they learn' that can help position community college graduates to meet local workforce needs;
- 2. As a best practice, the state should invest more in what is currently working by providing significant capacity-building resources to community colleges across the state, opening the door for new programs and better support services;
- 3. As a guideline, the state should place a priority on the student success of individuals from under-resourced communities. Partnerships with social service providers can help ensure persons hardest hit by the pandemic have what they need to not only survive the virus but to thrive post COVID-19;
- 4. Create consistent guidelines for employee and student self-testing, as well as establish the conditions necessary for employees to return to work or for students to return to campus after exposure to COVID-19 or recovery from illness;
- 5. Establish guidelines to encourage colleges to focus on brand, quality, and innovation across the system given the new virtual environment and the increased competition for California community college student enrollment in the 'on-line' market;
- 6. Create statewide guidelines, in partnership with labor unions, that outline best practices for flexibility for high risk employees due to them having either a pre-existing condition or working in an area of high exposure as an essential worker;
- 7. As a best practice encourage the development of staggering timelines for staff to return to work earlier than students in order to run through cleaning and sanitization cycles as well as proper use of PPE;
- 8. As a best practice, create system standards for digital transformation (e-signatures; expense management; performance evaluations, etc.) and overall remote workforce

needs to set the pace for modernization and the expectations that should accompany such progress;

- As a best practice, maintain a high-level advisory group that is composed of education, business, government and civic leaders to continually monitor the recovery efforts – current efforts are too bifurcated and can create a feeling of "information and 'webinar' overload" for community leaders;
- 10. As a system framework, review strategic plan (Vision for Success Goals) what should we 'stop doing' and what should we 'start doing' in the post COVID19 environment? What should we do differently? How can we plan more for short term outcomes? For instance, there may be more immediate value in planning 6 months out rather than the traditional planning of 3 years or 5 years out;
- 11. As a best practice, create a dashboard that will track economic recovery efforts as they pertain to the progress made by racially minoritized and low-income populations that are shouldering the brunt of the COVID-19 impact;
- 12. As a guideline, utilize the strategic locations of community colleges, support the establishment of COVID19 test centers on college campuses system wide; placing a priority of communities where access to health care is limited.

CONCLUSION

The COVID-19 pandemic has forced California's community college to make more dramatic changes in a shorter timeframe than at any time in the history of our system. The Safe Campus Reopening Workgroup hopes that this Report provides helpful, practical information and guidelines to consider in the coming months as colleges begin the challenging process of slowly re-engaging students, employees and community members face-to-face. The Workgroup also recognizes that the Report may be in some ways dissatisfying to the extent that leaders were anticipating definitive, detailed and specific guidance on a broad array of complicated issues. The reality as of the date of the Report is that we simply do not know the answers to all the questions. In addition, the answers to the difficult questions will vary depending on local conditions.

As challenging as the last few months have been for our colleges, the day will come when we will once again be able to gather together. The road ahead will be difficult, but the planning underway and the willingness to collaborate and engage all stakeholders will allow us, as Governor Newsom frequently states, to "meet the moment."

Resource List as of May 22, 2020

The following links are to resources as of the date of the Report. Recommendations based on these resources will be updated as the guidance evolves. Be sure to look for updated guidance and resources in this rapidly changing situation.

American Association of Community Colleges Resource Page: https://www.aacc.nche.edu/publications-news/covid-19-updates-resources/

American College Health Association's Considerations for Reopening Higher Education Institutions:

https://www.acha.org/documents/resources/guidelines/ACHA Considerations for Reopening IHEs in the COVID-19 Era May2020.pdf

California Community College Chancellor's Office (CCCCO) Resource Page: https://www.cccco.edu/About-Us/Chancellors-Office/Divisions/Communications-and-Marketing/Novel-Coronavirus

CCCCO Space Inventory Handbook: https://www.cccco.edu/-/media/CCCCO-Website/Files/Finance-and-Facilities/x space-invntry-hndbk-2007-ada.ashx

California Community College Student Senate survey on COVID-19: https://www.studentsenateccc.org/communication/covid-19-survey-report.html

California Department of Public Health website: https://www.cdph.ca.gov/Programs/CID/DCDC/Pages/Immunization/ncov2019.aspx

Community College League of California's resource page: https://www.ccleague.org/novel-coronavirus-2019-covid-19

CDC guidance on Re-opening Colleges and Universities:

https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/community/colleges-universities/considerations.html

CDC Community Mitigation Strategy (appendix A has a list of underlying medical conditions): https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/downloads/community-mitigation-strategy.pdf

CDC's Interim Guidance to Colleges and Universities: https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/downloads/guidance-administrators-college-higher-education.pdf

CDC's Guidance on Cleaning Facilities https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/community/disinfecting-building-facility.html

CDC's Explanation of Social Distancing: https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/prevent-getting-sick/social-distancing.html

CDC's Explanation of cloth face coverings: https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/prevent-getting-sick/diy-cloth-face-coverings.html

CDC's Forecasting webpage: https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/covid-data/forecasting-us.html

FEMA Resource Website: https://www.fema.gov/coronavirus

FEMA Fact Sheet on Planning Considerations for Organizations in Reconstituting Operations during the COVID-19 Pandemic: https://www.fema.gov/news-release/2020/04/30/planning-considerations-organizations-reconstituting-operations-during-covid

National Science Foundation website: https://www.nsf.gov/discoveries/disc_summ.jsp?cntn_id=300334&org=NSF

Occupational Safety and Health Administration (OSHA) COID-19 website: https://www.osha.gov/SLTC/covid-19/

OSHA Guidance on Preparing Workplaces for COVID-19: https://www.osha.gov/Publications/OSHA3990.pdf

State of California website: https://covid19.ca.gov/